



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 11

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, March 8, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Ms Graham, Chairman, Select Standing Committee on Private Bills, presented the following petitions for Private Bills:

of the Grand Lodge of the Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks of the Dominion of Canada for the Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks of the Province of Alberta Repeal Act;

of William Roper Hull Child and Family Services for the William Roper Hull Child and Family Services Amendment Act, 2000;

of the Town of Pincher Creek and the Municipal District of Pincher Creek No. 9 for the Westcastle Development Authority Repeal Act;

of Larry Gilchrist, on behalf of the Calgary Municipal Heritage Properties Authority, for the Calgary Municipal Heritage Properties Authority Amendment Act, 2000;

of the Calgary Foundation for the repeal and replacement of the Calgary Foundation Act.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 238 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 227 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 220 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 234 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 219 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 595 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Lund, Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Development, pursuant to the Brand Act, c.B-11, s20.6(3); the Stray Animals Act, cS-23, s.22.6(3); the Livestock Identification and Brand Inspection Act, c.L-22.5; s32.6(3) and the Livestock and Livestock Products Act, c.L-24, s22.6(3):

Livestock Identification Services Limited, Manager's Report for the period ended March 31, 1999

Sessional Paper 207/2000

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations:

Letter dated March 7, 2000, from Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations, to Murdoch Davis, Editor in Chief, Edmonton Journal, regarding a correction of misinformation generated by a report prepared by the Caledon Institute of Social Policy and published in an Edmonton Journal article dated March 3, 2000, entitled "For Profit Hospitals Raise Health Costs, Think-tank Says"

Sessional Paper 208/2000

Mr. Lougheed, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan:

Newsletter dated February 2000, entitled "Status Report: The Quarterly Newsletter on Disabilities in Alberta", prepared by the Premier's Council on the Status of Persons with Disabilities

Sessional Paper 209/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

11 letters, undated, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing their opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual agreements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 210/2000

Letter dated March 8, 2000, and attachments, from Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, to Robert Clark, Ethics Commissioner, requesting an investigation in a possible breach of the Conflicts of Interest Act by Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie

Sessional Paper 211/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

3 letters dated February 22, 2000, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, requesting that the development of the Spray Valley by Genesis Land Corporation be stopped

Sessional Paper 212/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter dated March 8, 2000, and attachments, from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding support of the 5 principles of the Canada Health Act by Progressive Conservative Members of the Legislative Assembly

Sessional Paper 213/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

4 letters, undated, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing their opposition to the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual agreements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 214/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Excerpt from a 1993 document outlining “Our 4-Year Plan” prepared by “Ralph’s Team for a better Alberta”

Sessional Paper 215/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated August 20, 1999, from Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, to Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, requesting the Government to consider a reduction in the 9 cent per litre provincial fuel tax

Sessional Paper 216/2000

Memorandum dated September 16, 1991, from Dwayne Brandly, Operations Supervisor, Edmonton Regional Office, Consumer and Corporate Affairs, to Bert Dyck, Assistant Deputy Minister, Community Services, Consumer and Corporate Affairs, regarding a concern about the manufacturers of pine shakes and shingles

Sessional Paper 217/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Memorandum dated March 8, 2000, from Peter J.M. Lown, Q.C., to Lynne Duncan, Deputy Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding a comparative review of the Saskatchewan Health Facilities Licensing Act and regulations and Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 218/2000

The Health Facilities Licensing Act, cH-0.02, Province of Saskatchewan

Sessional Paper 219/2000

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

Designated Supply Sub-Committee Agreement, March 6, 2000

Sessional Paper 220/2000

Recognitions

Mr. Coutts, Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod: Joe Crowshoe, Sr., 93 year old ceremonialist and spiritual leader for the Peigan nation, who passed away October 28, 1999.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre: International Women’s Day, March 8, 2000, and the launch of the World March of Women 2000.

Mr. Broda, Hon. Member for Redwater: 80th anniversary dinner of the Edmonton Burns Club held on January 25, 2000, celebrating the life of Robert Burns, Scottish poet, and the unveiling of the statue of Robert Burns in Oliver Park, sculpted by John Weaver.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East: Chris Spearman of Lethbridge for his efforts in communicating with the oil industry to bring down the price of gas in Lethbridge.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: International Women's Day, March 8, 2000, and the launch of the World March of Women 2000.

Point of Privilege - Contempt

Yesterday, at the conclusion of Question Period and after the Chair provided his ruling to the House regarding the Official Opposition House Leader's purported point of privilege, the Honourable Government House Leader raised a point of order about the propriety of certain comments made by the Opposition House Leader in giving notice of and arguing the question of privilege. Frankly, the Chair is of the opinion that the ruling given yesterday ended the matter but the Chair undertook to review Hansard and address the issue.

Essentially the Government House Leader and Deputy House Leader rose to demand an apology from the Official Opposition House Leader for comments the House Leader of the Official Opposition made last Thursday, March 2, 2000, in giving notice about the purported question of privilege concerning an "assault" that allegedly occurred in the Press Conference Room at the technical briefing session for the media. At page 229 of Hansard for that day, the Opposition House Leader stated: "a young woman, an employee of the government - and I think it serves little purpose to embarrass the individual woman..."

The Opposition House Leader did not identify the person in question by name and did not pursue the alleged assault when he made his submissions on the question of privilege on Monday. He never retracted them. So in one sense it appears that we have a dispute about facts between Members on which the Chair is not going to intervene. To reiterate, the Chair's view is that this matter was concluded yesterday when the ruling was given. The Chair would remind Members of the principles in Beauchesne's at paragraph 493(4) to exercise great care in making statements in the House about persons outside of the Assembly who are not able to respond. In the Chair's view, this matter is now concluded.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were accepted:

WQ1. Moved by Dr. Nicol on behalf of Mrs. Soetaert:

How much did the former Department of Transportation and Utilities spend in fiscal years 1990-91, 1991-92, 1992-93, 1993-94 and 1998-99 for work conducted by the Department on primary highway maintenance with respect to direct operating and contract costs and supervision, inspection and audit, in the summer (April to October) and winter (November to March) months?

WQ2. Moved by Mr. White:

How many Alberta Environment staff and how many individuals on contract were available to fight forest fires on April 1, July 1 and October 1, 1999 and what were the equivalent numbers for the same dates in 1998?

WQ3. Moved by Mr. White:

What base resources were available to fight forest fires in Alberta at the beginning of the 1992, 1993, 1998 and 1999 fire seasons, including the number and type of air tankers, the number and type of helicopters and the number and size of wildland firefighting units?

WQ4. Moved by Mr. Gibbons on behalf of Ms. Carlson:

How many fish and wildlife officers and how many park rangers were employed by Alberta Environment on April 1, in 1992 and 1998, and how many conservation officers were employed on April 1, 1999 to carry out the duties previously performed by fish and wildlife officers and park rangers?

WQ5. Moved by Mr. White

During the calendar year 1999, how many full-time equivalent staff were employed in the entire Land and Forest Service, and specifically how many were employed in the Forest Management Division and in the Forestry Regional and Area offices; what was the total area of allocated Crown land (held under forest management agreements and other forms of tenure) on which forest management operations had to be supervised and how many full-time equivalent staff were involved in monitoring in the field?

WQ6. Moved by Mr. White:

How many forest officers with the working title or classification of Forest Officer, Forester, Agrologist, or Manager in Land and Forest Service, were employed by the then Alberta Environmental Protection on April 1, 1999?

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ7, WQ8.

Motions for Returns

The following Motions for Returns were accepted:

MR5. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by, or for, the Department of Resource Development between May 25, 1999 and February 17, 2000 providing the yearly projection of upside interest accruing to the Province from the operations of the Lloydminster Bi-provincial Upgrader for the period 2000-2014 as specified under the Upside Interest Agreement of February 7, 1995 between the Government and CIC (Crown Investment Corporation) Industrial Interests Inc.

MR9. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by, or for, the Electricity Supply Task Force or submitted to the Electricity Supply Task Force between June 2, 1999 and February 17, 2000.

The following Motions for Returns were rejected:

MR6. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by, or for, the Department of Resource Development between May 25, 1999 and February 17, 2000 evaluating the human resources requirements and funding framework for the Alberta Energy and Utilities Board (AEUB).

MR7. Moved by Mr. Gibbons:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of reports prepared by Kent Marketing for the Department of Infrastructure on gasoline fuel consumption in Alberta for the period January 1, 1999 to February 17, 2000.

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR1, MR2, MR3, MR4, MR8, MR10, MR11, MR12, MR13, MR14, MR15, MR16, MR17.

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 202 Marriage Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Doerksen

A debate followed.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, moved the Bill be amended by striking out section 5.

A debate followed (on amendment).

The question being put, with Mr. Tannas in the Chair, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 10

Blakeman	Graham	Olsen
Boutilier	Magnus	Paul
Dickson	Nicol	Soetaert
Gibbons		

Against the motion: 39

Amery	Hlady	Renner
Broda	Jacques	Severtson
Burgener	Jonson	Smith
Cao	Klapstein	Stelmach
Cardinal	Kryczka	Stevens
Clegg	Laing	Strang
Doerksen	Langevin	Tarchuk
Ducharme	Mar	Taylor
Fischer	Marz	Thurber
Fritz	Nelson	West
Haley	Oberg	Woloshyn
Havelock	Paszkowski	Yankowsky
Herard	Pham	Zwozdesky

And after some time spent therein, the Speaker resumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported:

Bill 202 Marriage Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Doerksen

Mr. Tannas, Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 202 (Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo) — Defeated on division

Sessional Paper 133/2000

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 205 Emblems of Alberta (Alberta Dress Tartan) Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Stevens

A debate followed.

During debate, Mr. Stevens, Hon. Member for Calgary-Glenmore, tabled the following:

Copy of a sample of the current Alberta Tartan

Sessional Paper 221/2000

Copy of a sample of the proposed Alberta Dress Tartan

Sessional Paper 222/2000

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 205 Emblems of Alberta (Alberta Dress Tartan) Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Stevens

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, that it be called 5:30 p.m., it was agreed at 5:17 p.m. that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. it would be in Committee of Supply, and the Speaker left the Chair.

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 8, 2000— 8:00 P.M.

Committee of Supply (Days 10 and 11 — Main Estimates)

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Tannas reported as follows:

Madam Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the Executive Council for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001 (Subcommittee A), reports progress thereon, and requests leave to sit again.

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the Department of Infrastructure for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001 (Subcommittee B), reports progress thereon, and requests leave to sit again.

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Third Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Third time:

Bill 12 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

A debate followed.

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 12 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:17 p.m. until Thursday, March 9, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, March 8, 2000